An inquiry into the connection between decisions and their impacts: 
A case study of Nelson Mandela’s decisions and their impacts

Ryan D. Higbea 
Kaposia Education Center 
Spring 2014 
Grade 5

2014 3M Innovative Economic Educator Award 
Elementary, 2nd Place
Innovation

This fifth grade economics lessons is an original one. I wrote it using the knowledge and understandings I gained in the summer of 2013 during the “Using Children’s Literature to Teach Economics and Personal Finance” course at the University of Minnesota.

This lesson is innovative for three reasons. First, students use a Flow Map (a type of Thinking Map®), as a decision-making model, rather than a decision tree or PACED decision-making process, as suggested in the Minnesota economic benchmark. I chose to use this alternative graphic organizer for decision-making because students are already familiar with it from studying cause and effect relationships during literacy instruction.

Second, this lesson is innovative because I have selected a book that is not used in other economic lesson plans, to my knowledge. Throughout the “Using Children’s Literature to Teach Economics and Personal Finance” course, *Nelson Mandela* by Kadir Nelson was not a text brought up. Furthermore, a Google search using the key words: “using ‘Nelson Mandela’ by Kadir Nelson teach economics” did not produce any results for economic lesson plans for teaching economics to elementary students. Therefore, I am drawing the conclusion that this is the first lesson using this text to teach economics to elementary-aged students.

Finally, this lesson is innovative because I focus on students developing a conceptual understanding of decisions and their impacts, rather than just learning specific knowledge about Nelson Mandela’s decisions. Students need to develop conceptual understandings that are timeless, abstract, universal, and transferrable through concrete examples, although many lesson plans and the teachers who deliver them often do not push past the concrete examples to the conceptual understandings. “The factual knowledge is what students must know in order to describe, discuss, explain, or analyze the deeper concepts. One cannot understand the conceptual level without the supporting factual knowledge. But there must be a synergy (emphasis added) between the two levels if we are to systematically develop intelligence,” (Erickson, H.L., (2007). *Concept-based curriculum and instruction for the thinking classroom*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press, p. 3). During this lesson, students are asked to use synergistic thinking as they think about the concepts of decisions and their impacts by examining concrete examples found in the text. To check for their conceptual understanding, the summative assessment of the lesson requires students to apply their newly formed conceptual understanding to a context different than that in which they learned it originally.
Overview

Lesson Description:
The students will

• learn about Apartheid in South Africa and the life of Nelson Mandela, the decisions he made, and the connection between those decisions and how they impacted his life, South Africa, and the world.
• make their thinking visible using a flow map as a decision-making model
• identify an alternative choice that Mandela could have made and identify probable impacts.
• create a generalization based on the learning they did about Mandela, his decisions, and their impacts and apply their conceptual understanding to a new context.

Context
The elementary school where I work is a Primary Years Program of the International Baccalaureate, which is “a curriculum framework designed for students aged 3 to 12. It focuses on the development of the whole child as an inquirer, both in the classroom and in the world outside. It is defined by six transdisciplinary themes of global significance, explored using knowledge and skills derived from six subject areas, with a powerful emphasis on inquiry-based learning,” (https://www.ibo.org/pyp/).

As one of two elementary schools in the district, there is a student population of about 870 students, in grades kindergarten through six. Just over half of the students are white, 30% are Hispanic, and 11% are black. In 2013, 56.6% of students tested were proficient in math as measured by the Minnesota Comprehensive Assessment, whereas 47.5% were proficient in reading. Sixteen percent of the students are learning English, 12% of students have an IEP, and 60% receive a free/reduced priced lunch. There are about 25 students in each fifth grade class.

Appropriate Grade Level: Grade 5

Time Required: 1.5 hours (two 45-minute sessions; one for literacy and one for economics. It will be best if the sessions are taught consecutively.)

Essential Question:
What is the connection between decisions and short- and long-term impacts?

Learning Objectives:
Students will be able to:
• identify an alternative choice that Mandela could have made and probable impacts that decision would have had on his life and on life in South Africa.
• apply the conceptual understanding to a new context and provide adequate reasoning.

List of Economic Concepts Explicitly Covered in Activity
• Decisions
• Choices
• Impacts (short- and long-term)

Minnesota Academic Standards and Benchmarks
• MN Social Studies Standards (2011), Economics, Economic Reasoning Skills: People make informed economic choices by identifying their goals, interpreting and applying data, considering the short- and long-run costs and benefits of alternative choices and revising their goals based on their analysis.
Benchmark 5.2.1.1: Apply a decision-making process to identify an alternative choice that could have been made for a historical event; explain the probable impact of that choice. For example: Decision-making processes - a decision tree, PACED decision-making process (Problem, Alternative, Criteria, Evaluation, Decision).

- MN English Language Arts Standards (2010), **Reading**: Analyze how and why individuals, events, and ideas develop and interact over the course of a text.
  - Informational Text Benchmark 5.2.3.3: *Explain the relationships* or interactions between two or more individuals, events, ideas, or concepts in a historical, scientific, or technical text based on specific information in the text.

- MN Social Studies Standards (2011), **History**, Peoples, Cultures, and Changes Over Time: Historical events have multiple causes and can lead to varied and unintended outcomes.
  - Benchmark 5.4.2.3.1: Analyze multiple causes and outcomes of a historical event. For example: Historical event - the Columbian Exchange, the Seven Year’s War

**Materials Needed**

- Many of the materials needed for this lesson are contained in a Google Presentation that can be projected for the students to see: [https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1vvi9mzvDWzUSKOVzf6WB4orBMWXNZZx3-1wKQWiYZ1/edit?usp=sharing](https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1vvi9mzvDWzUSKOVzf6WB4orBMWXNZZx3-1wKQWiYZ1/edit?usp=sharing)
- Small whiteboards for students to use, markers, erasers
- Chart paper, markers (optional)
- Visuals (attached)
  - #1: World Map, with South Africa highlighted
  - #2: Simple timeline of Nelson Mandela’s life
  - #3: Example Flow Map showing a decision and its impacts
  - #4: The decision to read daily and its impacts
- Technology to display visuals, such as a SMARTboard, computer, projector
- VIDEO: *Apartheid: 46 years in 90 Seconds* - BBC, [http://youtu.be/2f2k6iDFCL4](http://youtu.be/2f2k6iDFCL4)
- Sheets of white legal-sized paper, cut lengthwise into two pieces (measuring 4.25” x 14”), enough so that every student has two pieces.
- Pencils, erasers
- *Nelson Mandela* by Kadir Nelson (Reading level: DRA 40 / GR Q, beginning of Grade 4)
- Whiteboard/Markers (or SMARTboard)
- Scotch tape
- Document Camera (optional)
- Rubric for assessing students’ understanding (attached)

**Procedure**

I’m assuming that the students have prior understanding of:
- Cause-effect relationships (what they are and how to identify them in texts)

**Literacy Session (45-minutes)**

1) **Invite** the students into the inquiry.
a) **Tell** students to get out a pencil and **pass out** one blank ½ sheet of legal paper to each student. Once they have a pencil and paper out on their desk, **tell** them to get out a small whiteboard, a marker, and eraser and gather with those materials in front of the SMARTboard.

b) **Ask**, “What do you **think** you know about Nelson Mandela? What do you **think** you know about a set of laws in his country called Apartheid? Quickly write some ideas down on your whiteboard and cap your marker when you’re done.” This quick, formative pre-assessment will give you a good understanding of the background knowledge your specific learners bring to this lesson. You can have students share and collect their ideas on a piece of chart paper or on a SMARTboard, or you can just quickly scan their whiteboards to understand their background knowledge of Nelson Mandela and Apartheid.

c) **Say**, “Today, we’re going to be looking at Nelson Mandela’s life, but more importantly, we’re going to be talking about different decisions he made and how those decisions impacted his life and his country.”

d) **Show** a world map (Visual #1), highlighting South Africa. **Say**, “Nelson Mandela was from South Africa.”

   **Point out** the current location of the students on the map in relation to South Africa.

e) **Show** a simple timeline of Nelson Mandela’s life (Visual #2). **Say**, “Nelson Mandela made some decisions for which he was arrested. He was arrested because he was fighting against a set of laws called Apartheid. Apartheid kept people who were different from each other, separated. Let’s watch a short video to learn a little bit more about Apartheid and why Nelson Mandela wanted to fight against it.”

f) **Show** the video: Apartheid: 46 years in 90 Seconds - BBC, [http://youtu.be/2f2k6iDFCL4](http://youtu.be/2f2k6iDFCL4).

g) **Review** Apartheid. Ask, “From the video, what more do you understand about Apartheid?” If you started recording what they knew about Mandela and Apartheid before, you can add to that list now.

   It is important that students have a simple, age-appropriate understanding of Apartheid, because it will help them understand how Mandela’s decisions impacted it. Possible responses:

   i) A set of laws in South Africa.
ii) Keeping whites, blacks, and Indians in South Africa separate.

iii) Like segregation in the United States.

iv) People were violent towards each other, there were arrests.

h) Review a flow map, a tool used to show one’s thinking about cause-effect relationships. Say, “We’re going to use a flow map so we can think about the decisions Mandela made and the impacts they had throughout his entire life.”

i) Show an example of a flow map, showing a decision and its impacts (such as the one on Visual #3.) Say, “Here is an example of a simple flow map based on a decision I made this morning.” As you explain the flow map, emphasize the economic vocabulary of choices, decisions, and impacts.

j) Say, “Because of the decision I made this morning, I can concentrate on learning and thinking right now. As a result, I get to learn a lot of new and interesting ideas.”

k) Ask, “What do you notice the parts of a flow map are?” Listen for these responses:
   i) Boxes with words that describe what’s going on.
   ii) Arrows connecting the boxes, showing the cause-effect relationships.

l) Say, “Turn to a partner and tell them what you need to make a flow map.” This turn-and-talk will assure that everyone knows the parts of a flow map before continuing with the lesson.

m) Call the students’ attention again and say, “This flow map shows the short-term impacts of the decisions I made this morning.” Ask, “What would a long-term impact of the decision I made this morning be? A long-term impact is something that will happen in the future.” Possible responses:
   i) “I’ll be able to do my homework, because I learned what I was supposed to during class.”
   ii) “I’ll be ready to learn something else.”
   iii) “I’ll be able to go to the next grade.”
   iv) “I’ll be able to graduate from high school.”
   v) “I’ll be able to get a job that I want.”
   vi) “I’ll be able to go to college.”
n) **Say,** “And all that because I ate a couple of eggs! That’s why even the simplest decisions that we make every day are important. All the decisions we make impact our lives in the short-term and in the long-term; even something as simple as deciding what we should eat for breakfast.”

o) **Ask,** “What if I would have made a different choice this morning? Imagine I would have decided to skip breakfast?” Possible responses:

   i) You would be hungry.

   ii) You’d focus on being hungry, not thinking and learning.

   iii) You wouldn’t be able to concentrate.

   iv) You wouldn’t be able to learn.

p) **Say,** “The decisions we make really affect what happens after, so we have to be careful about what we decide. Our decisions have short- and long-term impacts. Now, let’s take a look at the decisions that Nelson Mandela made and how they impacted his life.”

2) **Investigate** the connection between decisions and their impacts.

   a) **Tell** students they’ll make a flow map as they listen to the story. **Say,** “We are going to use a pencil and a long sheet of paper to make a flow map. We’ll use the flow map to show our thinking about the decisions we hear Nelson Mandela making. Anytime you hear Nelson Mandela make an important decision, I want us to write it down on our flow map. I’ll make a flow map on the board as we go too. Please keep your flow map in one long line - **do not** start a second line. This will be important for the second part of our investigation.” Send students back to their desks.

   b) **Read** the book. **Stop** after the first page and **say,** “I heard that Nelson’s parents decided to send him to school. Let’s write that on our flow map. Because the flow map is to show my own thinking, I only need to write the most important ideas. **Write,** “Parents decided to send N. to school” on the board. **Draw** a box around it with a short arrow to the right.

   c) **Continue reading** once all students have written down the first decision. **Tell** the students, “Anytime you hear a decision being made, we’ll add it to our flow map.” As you continue reading and writing
with the students, encourage them to use the word, “decided” as they describe the decisions being made in the text. Also, point out throughout the reading how every subsequent decision being made was affected by the previous decisions that were made. This is graphically evident on the flow map since all decisions will be connected with arrows; just make sure to point it out to the students so that they clearly understand how all the decisions Nelson made were connected to decisions that were made previously. The finished flow map should include these decisions:

i) Nelson’s parents decided to send him to school

ii) Nelson’s mom decided to send him to the chief.

iii) Nelson decided to become a lawyer.

iv) Nelson decided to organize rallies to protest apartheid.

v) Nelson decided to continue to fight apartheid after his arrest.

vi) Nelson decided to hide.

vii) Nelson decided to return to S. Africa.

viii) Nelson decided to run for president.

d) Conclude the literacy session by reviewing the entire flow map. Emphasize the economic language of decisions, choice, and impacts. Say, “Each time Mandela made a decision, he had several choices he could have made. Each time he decided from all those different choices, it impacted his life immediately and in the future; in other words, there were short- and long-term impacts to his decisions. The greatest and most important impact that happened as a result of all of Mandela’s
decisions was that Apartheid ended and there was peace in South Africa. Let’s make sure to add that to the end of our flow map.”

Economic Session (45-minutes)

e) Say, “After studying Nelson Mandela’s life, the decisions he made, and how they impacted his life and his country, we know that each time he made a decision it impacted his life in a specific way. If he had made just one decision differently, his entire life would have been impacted in a different way. Who knows if Apartheid ever would have ended? Who knows if South Africa ever would have become a peaceful country? We can’t know for sure what would have happened if Nelson would have made a different choice at any point during his life, but we can use creative and critical thinking to imagine what might have happened.”

f) Say, “For this next part of the investigation, I’m going to give you a new sheet of paper. I want you to pick any one of the decisions Mandela did make and cover it up with the new sheet of paper. Then, I want you to create another choice Nelson could have made at that part of his life. Next, you’ll continue the flow map and show how that new and different decision might have impacted his life. Basically, you’re writing a new story with a new ending.”

g) Provide students with an example. “The very first decision that was made was that Nelson’s parents decided to send him to school. How would Nelson’s life look differently if they would have made a different choice? Since it was the first decision made, I’m going to cover up the entire flow map with my new paper. If Nelson’s parents hadn’t decided to send him to school, I need to create an alternative choice: “Nelson’s parents put him to work on the farm.” Next, I need to show how that decision would have impacted his life and his country. I don’t know for sure, but I’m assuming that if he never would have gone to school, he probably wouldn’t have become a lawyer and he might not have become a leader in the fight against Apartheid. Since I covered up the entire flow map, I need to create a completely different flow map of what might have happened since that first decision was made differently.”
h) **Show** students the attached rubric on which they’ll be assessed and clearly **explain** the expectations:

“As you’re creating a new, alternative story based on an alternative choice Mandela *could* have made, remember to still think of choices and impacts that *probably* could have happened. Also, make sure you’re providing the same number of boxes on your flow map as you’re covering up. One last thing to remember: we know that the greatest and most important impact that happened as a result of all of Mandela’s decisions was that Apartheid ended and there was peace in South Africa. So, since you’re changing one of Mandela’s decisions, I want you to make clear how that would have impacted Apartheid and the peace in South Africa.

i) **Ask for** and **answer** any questions.

j) **Pass out** the new sheets of paper.

k) **Clarify** the task for any students who appear confused.

l) **Check in** with students as they work to make sure they are correctly completing the learning activity.

   As you walk around the room, **tape** their new piece of paper to the existing flow map with scotch tape, covering up the original flow map at the point that their “new” decision was made.

m) **Allow** students to work with others if they need that support.

3) **Provide time for students to demonstrate** their learning

   a) **Invite** students to share their “new” flow maps with the class. **Display** their work under a document camera, if that is available. **Use** the rubric with the class to assess the students’ understanding.

   (Teacher’s note: using language like “what’s one good thing and one thing s/he could get better at?” or “a star and a wish” is less threatening to students, especially since you’re assessing their work in front of the class. However, being able to give this kind of immediate feedback to students is shown to be one of the most effective teaching strategies that has the greatest impact on student learning and achievement. To learn more about effective teaching strategies, see: Hattie, J. (2012). *Visible learning for teachers: Maximizing impact on learning*. New York, New York: Routledge. Therefore, giving feedback in this way is essential, but must be done sensitively.)
b) Say, “Based on what we learned today about Nelson Mandela, his decisions, and their impacts, what can we say about decisions, choices, and impacts?” Instruct students to write down their ideas of a generalization on their whiteboards. Then, have students share their ideas so that as a class, they will create a generalization to summarize what they learned about decisions and their impacts. Generalizations must be timeless, universal, abstract (to a degree), and transferrable. Students will most likely start with a concrete statement, specifically about Nelson Mandela. Encourage students to create a generalization that could apply anywhere to anyone. It should even be able to be applied to us and the decisions we make. Possible responses:

i) “Decisions have short- and long-term impacts.”

ii) “What is decided today will affect what happens later on.”

iii) “Be careful when making decisions. You never know how it will impact your life later on.”

iv) “The decisions we make have an impact on our life.”

Summative Assessment

1) Say, “Now that we understand that the decisions we make have short- and long-term impacts on our life, I want you to answer one last question on the back of your paper. Every teacher all through elementary school has told you to read every night. Based on what we learned about decisions today, tell me about your decision about nightly reading and the impacts that decision will have on your life. The point of doing this is to see if you learned anything today about the connection between the decisions you make and the impacts they have. You can answer in a paragraph or with a flow map.”

2) Show students the rubric you will use to assess their work.

3) Collect students’ flow maps and assess their conceptual understanding using the attached rubric.

Closure

1) Show visual #4. Discuss with the students about the different decisions that are represented in the graphic and the short- and long-term impacts those decisions will have (both those that are explicit and implicit on
Encourage students to use the economic vocabulary of *decisions, choices, and impacts* during the closing discussion.

**Extension Ideas**

1) Depending on the time available, the available copies of the text, the independent reading level of the students, and their familiarity with using a flow map to show cause-effect relationships, the literacy portion of this lesson could be done in small groups. Begin the activity as a whole group and record the first two decisions Mandela’s parents made to get the students started. Then, turn the task over to the small groups (step 2c in the plan). Best practice says that while students are working, the teacher shouldn’t hover, but instead should take notes on what the groups are doing and give that feedback to the groups afterward. To learn more about groupwork, see: Cohen, E., (1994). *Designing groupwork: Strategies for the heterogeneous classroom*. New York, New York: Teachers College Press.

2) There are obvious connections between Nelson Mandela and the anti-Apartheid Movement in South Africa and Martin Luther King Jr. and the Civil Rights Movement in the United States. To be able to think more deeply about both movements, students could use a Double Bubble Thinking Map to examine the similarities and differences between the two movements.

3) Although Nelson Mandela and Apartheid are the focus of this lesson, the same procedure could be used to investigate the connection between decisions and their impacts of any historical figure or event. Teachers may want to select a different person or event to study based on the interests of their students and/or the curriculum instead of, or in addition to, studying Nelson Mandela and Apartheid.

4) Once students are familiar with analyzing historical figures’ decisions and subsequent impacts using a flow map, they could use that decision-making model to make their own future, personal decisions.

5) Because this lesson can be split into two separate parts, you could invite students to engage in their own research at home and find books on Mandela to share with others. The materials and content are engaging and interesting to students, so invite them to tap into that natural curiosity independently.

6) Principals and other behavior specialists could use the decision-making model described in this lesson as they work with students who have made “poor” decisions. Using the model would allow students to identify which decision wasn’t appropriate and think about the impacts that their decision had on themselves and on others. They could further use the model to make better decisions in the future, as described in Extension Idea #4 above.
Visual #1: World Map, with South Africa highlighted

http://geology.com/world/map/map-of-south-africa.gif
Visual #2: Simple timeline of Nelson Mandela’s life

created with http://www.readwritethink.org/files/resources/interactives/timeline_2/
Using a flow map to show cause-effect relationships

This morning, I decided to eat eggs and cheese on toast for breakfast.

It filled me up because of the balance of carbs, fats, and proteins.

I wasn’t hungry all morning, so I was able to concentrate.

I decided to concentrate on thinking and learning.

I learned lots of new and interesting ideas.
#4: The decision to read daily and its impacts

## Why Can’t I Skip My 20 Minutes of Reading Tonight?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student “A”</th>
<th>Student “B”</th>
<th>Student “C”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>reads 20 minutes each day</td>
<td>reads 5 minutes each day</td>
<td>reads 1 minute each day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3600 minutes in a school year</td>
<td>900 minutes in a school year</td>
<td>180 minutes in a school year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1,800,000 words

282,000 words

8,000 words

By the end of 6th grade Student “A” will have read the equivalent of 60 whole school days. Student “B” will have read only 12 school days. Which student would you expect to have a better vocabulary? Which student would you expect to be more successful in school...and in life?

(Nagy & Herman, 1987)

http://media-cache-ec0.pinimg.com/originals/ee/e7/b7/eee7b7a80af0fee3219d97bd65f6c8d3.jpg
The descriptors contained within this rubric are written without the specifics of this lesson. This is so that the rubric could still be used, regardless of the text used (if the teacher or student used to inquire into the connection between choices and their impacts with a historical figure/event different than Nelson Mandela as suggested in the extension ideas section). Furthermore, students could apply their conceptual understanding in a different way, other than the way suggested in the lesson, but the rubric could still be used to score their understanding.
Reflection

I taught this lesson to three fifth grade classes and have the following reflections:

1) The first time I taught this lesson, it took longer than the hour I had scheduled. So, I extended the total time of the lesson to 1.5 hours and broke it into a literacy session and an economic session. The subsequent times I taught the lesson, I was able to teach it all within the hour and a half.

2) Student knew little about Nelson Mandela. With each subsequent time I taught it, I tried to give them more and more background information before they started reading, so that they could make better meaning of what they were reading.

3) The first time I taught the lesson, we did not explicitly discuss how the ultimate impact of all of Mandela’s decisions was that Apartheid ended and there was peace in South Africa. Now in the lesson plan, I instruct the teacher to explicitly make this point, so that when students identify an alternative choice Mandela could have made, they'll also think about how Apartheid would have been impacted.

4) I was quite impressed each time I taught the lesson, with the students’ ability to create a conceptual statement, synthesizing the learning they had done about decisions, impacts, and choices. I wrote about this experience in the following blog post: http://making-teaching-visible.blogspot.com/2014/04/writing-conceptual-statements-with.html.

5) After teaching the literacy portion once in the whole group setting, I tried the extension idea of having the students complete the literacy portion in small groups in two different classrooms. Although this took longer, students were more engaged (they were reading, writing, listening to their peers, collaborating). The groups worked better in one classroom than they did in the other, which speaks to the importance of setting up norms for students as they work and learn in small groups and allowing them to work together often in groups. If you teach students how to work together, they can do it regardless of age.

6) I had a teacher in Maine teach this lesson to her 5th graders, to make sure that the activities were described in enough detail that another teacher could easily replicate them. Her feedback proved to be quite insightful:

   a. I particularly enjoyed how well thought out the sequencing was.
   b. I surprised by how little background knowledge students had on the subject area when we began. So, the maps and timelines you provided were effective for engaging students and giving them strong points of reference.
   c. My students are familiar with the workshop model, so the group/partner discussions and "turn and talks" were effective and thought provoking for them.
   d. They made several connections to the similarities of Mandela and Martin Luther King Jr. (this comment inspired one of the extension ideas).
   e. The text chosen was the perfect level and length to keep students invested.
   f. Many students were shocked that Mandela and the struggles in South Africa were recent and not hundreds of years ago.
   g. As we began day two of the lesson, students had done some of their own research at home and even found books on Mandela to share with others! Please know this shows how engaged and interested they were in the material (this comment inspired one of the extension ideas).
   h. One of my students said, "It's really interesting how his life was shaped and changed, starting with hearing stories of old Africa. I wonder what would have happened or if he still would have done all of this if he hadn't heard those stories?"
   i. I felt as though this lesson met the needs of all of my students. It incorporated supports to reach all learning styles and provided them with the information and background they needed to have deeper conversation and understanding of the topic.
**Student Work Examples for:** Students will be able to identify an alternative choice that Mandela could have made and probable impacts that decision would have had on his life.

*Note: for brevity’s sake, the student abbreviated Mandela’s name to “N.” for Nelson.*

This student decided to change the very first decision that was made. She created a probable alternative choice (parents decided not to send Nelson to school), includes the same number of impacts as the original flow map, and most are probable, but it didn’t make sense to me that Nelson decided that he wanted to move on in his life and then right after, he decided that he wanted to do nothing. Score: 4

This student changed the third decision. She created a probable alternative choice (that the chief took Nelson back to school), includes more impacts than the original flow map, and most are probable. However, she does not mention how Apartheid would have been affected. Score: 4

This student changed the fifth decision. He created a probable alternative choice (that Nelson gave up protesting), includes the same number of impacts as the original flow map, and they are probable. Although when I taught the lesson, I did not heavily emphasize how all of Mandela’s decisions ultimately led to the downfall of Apartheid, this student clearly understood that point. If any decision that Mandela made had been different, Apartheid would have “continued to go on”. Score: 5.
This student too changed the fifth decision. He also understands the point that Apartheid would have stayed, had Mandela given up. His thinking is just a little more complex though when he notes that if Mandela would have given up, others would have too. Score: 5

**Student Work Examples for:** Students will be able to apply the conceptual understanding to a new context and provide adequate reasoning.

In the lesson, the teacher is to give the students the prompt, “Every teacher all through elementary school has told you to read every night. Based on what we learned about decisions today, tell me about your decision about nightly reading and the impacts that decision will have.” However, since I taught this lesson the day before spring break, I asked the students if they could stop reading over spring break, to check their conceptual understanding of decisions and their impacts.

This student is unable to demonstrate any understanding of the concepts of decisions and their impacts. Instead, he states that it is impossible to not read, because of stop signs and other things you read every day. Score: 1

This student is using the economic vocabulary *decide* and *impact*. However, she’s a bit ambiguous how deciding to read now will have an impact. Score: 3

This student decided to write in paragraph form to demonstrate her understanding of the connections between decisions and their impacts. It is interesting that she is so eloquent, even though it is evident she is still learning English. Score: 4
This student uses the flow map to show how his decision now will have a short-term impact that will then have a long-term impact on his future. Score: 5